Wilderness Awareness Workshop

# Case Study Discussion Form

**1. Issue:** Preservation and management of significant archaeological sites co-located with non-developed recreation campsites along the Middle Fork of the Salmon River.

**2. Situation:** Numerous significant archeological sites exist in the FC-RONR Wilderness along the Middle Fork River, within the Wild and Scenic River corridor. Many of these sites are also designated campsites reserved for use by boaters during the control season for floating the Middle Fork River. These campsites are also at times used by stock-use groups, backpackers, and parties that fly in to airstrips located in the river corridor. Several sites are currently closed to overnight use, but allow day access.

Six programmatic objectives have been identified for management of the significant sites that are also campsites: protection and preservation of tribal treaty and cultural resources, protection of significant archaeological deposits as required by the National Historic Preservation Act, providing for an appropriate level of visitor use, preservation of the wilderness setting, providing for visitor education and enjoyment, and scientific study of the sites.

The desired future condition for the archaeological components of the sites include preservation from damage for a sample of the sites and further testing to allow for appropriate site-specific management recommendations. Regarding boat camps, the desired future condition should include sites that are adequately sized to accommodate use, have designated activity areas, minimal trails to reach activity areas, tent locations distributed across the site, and natural appearing vegetational screening between and defining the limits of activity areas. Consultation has begun and will need to continue with the State Historic Preservation Officer, the Advisory Council on Historic Preservation, the Shoshone-Bannock Tribes, and the Idaho Outfitters and Guides Association regarding protection and management of these sites. Many of the sites were burned over by wildland fires during the 2000 fire season.

**3. Management Question(s):** What methods are appropriate for preservation and management of the archeological sites?

**4. Direction/Guidance:**

**a. What does the Wilderness Act say?**

**WILDERNESS SYSTEM ESTABLISHED STATEMENT OF POLICY**

SECTION 2. (a) In order to assure that an increasing population, accompanied by expanding settlement and growing mechanization, does not occupy and modify all areas within the United States and its possessions, leaving no lands designated for preservation and protection in their natural condition, it is hereby declared to be the policy of the Congress to secure for the American people of present and future generations the benefits of an enduring resource of wilderness. For this purpose there is hereby established a National Wilderness

Preservation System to be composed of federally owned areas designated by the Congress as "wilderness areas," and these shall be administered for the use and enjoyment of the American people in such manner as will leave them unimpaired for future use and enjoyment as wilderness, and so as to provide for the protection of these areas, the preservation of their wilderness character, and for the gathering and dissemination of information regarding their use and enjoyment as wilderness; and no Federal lands shall be designated as "wilderness areas" except as provided for in this Act or by a subsequent Act.

**DEFINITION OF WILDERNESS**

(c) A wilderness, in contrast with those areas where man and his works dominate the landscape, is hereby recognized as an area where the earth and its community of life are untrammeled by man, where man himself is a visitor who does not remain. An area of wilderness is further defined to mean in this Act an area of undeveloped Federal land retaining its primeval character and influence, without permanent improvements or human habitation, which is protected and managed so as to preserve its natural conditions and which (1) generally appears to have been affected primarily by the forces of nature, with the imprint of man's work substantially unnoticeable; (2) has outstanding opportunities for solitude or a primitive and unconfined type of recreation; (3) has at least five thousand acres of land or is of sufficient size as to make practicable its preservation and use in an unimpaired condition; and (4) may also contain ecological, geological, or other features of scientific, educational, scenic, or historical value.

**USE OF WILDERNESS AREAS**

SECTION 4. (b) Except as otherwise provided in this Act, each agency administering any area designated as wilderness shall be responsible for preserving the wilderness character of the area and shall so administer such area for such other purposes for which it may have been established as also to preserve its wilderness character. Except as otherwise provided in this Act, wilderness areas shall be devoted to the public purposes of recreational, scenic, scientific, educational, conservation, and historical use.

(c) Except as specifically provided for in this Act, and subject to existing private rights, there shall be no commercial enterprise and no permanent road within any wilderness area designated by this Act and except as necessary to meet minimum requirements for the administration of the area for the purpose of this Act (including measures required in emergencies involving the health and safety of persons within the area), there shall be no temporary road, no use of motor vehicles, motorized equipment or motorboats, no landing of aircraft, no other form of mechanical transport, and no structure or installation within any such area.

b**. What does CIWA say**?

Section 8 (a) Cultural Resources Management

1. Cooperate with the Department of the Interior and the State of Idaho in conducting a cultural resources management program.
2. Such program shall have as its purposes the protection of archaeological sites and interpretation of such sites for the public benefit and knowledge insofar as these activities are compatible with the preservation of the values for which the wilderness and wild and scenic river were designated to protect.
3. To carry out the cultural resource management program…the Secretary shall …develop a cultural resources management plan for the resources and the river. Such plan shall-

(a) Encourage scientific research into man’s past use of the wilderness and the river corridor;

(b) Provide an outline for the protection of significant cultural resources, including protection from vandalism and looting as well as destruction from natural deterioration;

(c) be based on adequate inventory data, supplemented by test excavation data where appropriate;

(d) include a public interpretation program;

(e) comply with all federal and state historic and cultural statutes, regulations, guidelines, and standards.

**b. What is your agency policy?**

2323.1 - Management of Recreation

2323.11 - Objectives

1. Provide, consistent with management of the area as wilderness, opportunities for public use, enjoyment, and understanding of the wilderness, through experiences that depend upon a wilderness setting.

2. Provide outstanding opportunities for solitude or a primitive and unconfined type of recreation.

2323.12 - Policy

1. Maximize visitor freedom within the wilderness. Minimize direct controls and restrictions. Apply controls only when they are essential for protection of the wilderness resource and after indirect measures have failed.

2. Use information, interpretation, and education as the primary tools for management of wilderness visitors.

3. Manage for recreation activities that are dependent on the wilderness environment so that a minimum of adaptations within wilderness are necessary to accommodate recreation.

4. Consistent with management as wilderness, permit outfitter/guide operations where they are necessary to help segments of the public use and enjoy wilderness areas for recreational or other wilderness purposes.

2323.13a - Campsites. Do not designate campsites except as a last resort. Relocate or remove existing camps to allow maximum opportunity for solitude and to minimize the evidence of human use.

2323.8 - Management of Cultural and Historic Resources

2323.81 - Authority. The protection and management of cultural resources in wilderness are guided by the Antiquities Act (16 U.S.C. 431 et seq)., Historic Sites Act (16 U.S.C. 461), National Historic Preservation Act (16 U.S.C. 470), and implementing regulations 36 CFR 800, Executive Order 11593, Archaeological and Historic Data Preservation Act (1974), National Environmental Policy Act (42 U.S.C. 4321), Archaeological Resource Protection Act of 1979, and the individual forest and management plans.

2323.82 - Policy

1. Cultural resources are available for scientific study to the extent that the study is consistent with the concept of wilderness, the intent of the Wilderness Act, and cultural resource management objectives.

2. Cultural resources are available for recreational, scenic, scientific, educational, conservation, and historic uses, consistent with management as wilderness.

2323.83 - Studies and Management. Analyze on a case-by-case basis those studies requiring excavation of sites or dismantling of structures. Ensure that they are compatible with wilderness and cultural resource objectives as stated in the forest plan. As a general rule, cabins, shelters, or other structures approaching 50 years of age should be examined for their cultural resource value.

Remove those sites or structures that do not qualify for the National Register (FSM 2360) or allow them to deteriorate naturally unless they are:

1. Deemed necessary to support public purposes of wilderness, as set forth in section 4(b) of the Wilderness Act; or,

2. Serve administrative purposes (sec. 4(c) of the Wilderness Act).

Interpretation of cultural resources located in wilderness shall be done outside the wilderness. Verbal interpretive services by qualified wilderness rangers, volunteers, or permitted guides are acceptable.

Management direction for cultural resources eligible for nomination to the National Register is subject to compliance with section 106 of the National Historic Preservation Act and 36 CFR 800 (FSM 2366). A decision to remove, maintain, or allow a historic or prehistoric structure to deteriorate naturally is a Federal undertaking that will affect the cultural resource.

Regional Foresters may approve stabilization or restoration and subsequent maintenance of such structures if their continued existence is essential to cultural resource management. Do not use motorized equipment for restoration or maintenance unless essential (FSM 2326).

c. What does your forest plan or wilderness plan say?

FC-RONR Wilderness Management Plan:

(III)(K) Objectives: Recognize the cultural history of the area as a component of the wilderness resource and provide for appropriate protection, interpretation, and additional research.

(III)(K)(1)(c)(1) Comply with all existing federal laws, regulations, policies, and Executive Orders concerning the protection, management and enhancement of cultural resources.

(III)(K)(1)(c)(5) Educate users using off-site brochures and train Wilderness Rangers and Portal Assistants to emphasize cultural resources as a nonrenewable resource in need of protection. Make training available to outfitters and guides.

(III)(K)(1)(d)(6) Cultural resource sites continually threatened by human activity should be monitored on at least an annual basis.

(III)(K)(2)(b)(4) Where recreation or other activities impact significant or unevaluated cultural resource sites, the following guidelines will apply:

1. Conduct surface investigations, and when warranted, subsurface testing to determine significance and the range of impacts that are occurring.
2. If significant values are threatened, develop a protection or mitigation plan in consultation with the State Historic Preservation Officer (SHPO).
3. In river corridors and other heavily utilized areas, an annual review will be conducted by the administering National Forest to determine if changes in management and/or protection are needed.

**5. What are your management options?**

*Remember to split this minimum requirements decision making process into two parts:*

*Step 1 – Is any administrative action necessary?*

*Step 2 – If action is necessary, what is the minimum tool/method that will cause the least*

*degradation of the wilderness resource and character?*

Step 1: Is administrative action necessary? \_\_\_\_ YES \_\_\_\_\_ NO

Why?

Step 2: If the answer to Step 1 is YES, administrative action is necessary, then discuss the following

alternatives and others that your group develops:

For each of the most significant and highly impacted sites, specific recommendations are proposed for preservation and management.

Actions proposed include:

* Continued monitoring
* Site testing (including subsurface)
* Restoration activities
* Deliberate campsite design and site hardening to directly and indirectly control visitor use
* Seeding and re-seeding with native plants
* Weed control
* Consolidation of existing user trails
* Closure to stock use
* Continued closures at already closed sites
* Additional site closures
* Signing

What other alternatives are feasible?

**6. What is your decision?**

**7. What is the rationale for your decision?**

The rationale should link the decision made to wilderness management objectives, law, policy, forest plan standards and guidelines, etc. and explain how this decision best protects the wilderness character while addressing the problem in a feasible manner.

**8. What additional constraints are necessary to minimize disturbance to the wilderness resource and character?**

What mitigation measures are necessary?

Timing, location, or frequency of activity?

Maintenance requirements?

Standards or design requirements?

Monitoring?

**Actual Decision** (if made):

# Middle Fork Campsite Heritage Summary Recommendations

Complete the following protective measures for significant archaeological sites within the Middle Fork River corridor that are impacted by human use. Protective measures should be implemented using least restrictive and intrusive measures first and proceed to more intrusive and restrictive measures as earlier efforts fail to protect the resource.

* 1. Monitoring of site condition and assessment of protection measures should be conducted on an annual basis using professional Archaeologists to complete specific in-depth site monitoring activities and assessments and River Patrol to complete ongoing general site condition assessments, camp use spot checks, and enforcement of protection measures.
     1. Cultural resource sites continually threatened by human activity should be monitored on at least an annual basis.
     2. In river corridors and other heavily utilized areas, an annual review will be conducted by the administering National Forest to determine if changes in management and/or protection are needed.
  2. Provide educational opportunities or resource protection messages.
     1. Educate users using off-site brochures and and interpretive opportunities including Middle Fork Times to all successful permit applicants and outfitted parties, Native American Interpreters and portal assistants at launch sites, and providing site-specific camp maps with photos to parties that elect to camp in sensitive sites. Train Wilderness Rangers and portal assistants to emphasis cultural resources as a nonrenewable resource in need of protection. Make training available to outfitters and guides.
     2. Signing along the Middle Fork will be limited to those essential for resource protection, only. Post restoration messages at portals, with site signing to be used only when other resource protection measures fail. Signing will conform to plan and/or minimum tools standards and be implemented upon review of an appropriate ID Team.
     3. Interpretation of prehistoric sites along the Middle Fork Salmon Wild River should include, but not be limited to Rattlesnake Cave, Veil Cave, Lower Jackass, and White Creek and should consist of brochures or other means that are in keeping with wilderness values.
     4. Site specific closures involve informing the public through permits and posting notices at portals and at administrative sites. Only as a last effort will site signing be used for resource protection.
  3. Evaluate the significance and impacts to archaeological sites:
     1. In camps with visible signs of significant surface features (e.g., pithouses, pictograph panels, historic foundations, dense concentrations of surface cultural materials, etc.) use surface indications to record and determine significance and interpretive potential without resorting to subsurface evaluation methods.
     2. Where recreation and other activities impact significant or unevaluated cultural resource sites, conduct surface investigations, and when warranted, subsurface testing to determine significance and the range of impacts that are occurring. Thresholds for archaeological test unit evaluation is that sites are degraded to Frixell Class 5 level or sites have insufficient surface indications to allow a nondestructive finding of significance or impacts.
  4. Complete restoration activities where significant archaeological materials (e.g., pithouses, pictographs, historic foundations, and dense artifact concentrations) are threatened by human use. Restoration activities will use methods consistent with archaeological site and wilderness values protection, including:
     1. Use natural materials (i.e., rocks, logs, brush) to barrier and define use areas and protect features or artifact concentrations; or
     2. Where sites are degraded to Frixell Class 5 levels undertake site rehabilitation, such as scarification and seeding or planting of onsite native species. If vegetative rehabilitation fails use structural management controls developed through minimum tools analysis by an appropriate ID Team.
  5. Where less impacting methods have failed the following measures will be undertaken in a step-wise progression:
     1. Where users can easily identify open and closed portions of camps through geomorphic features (e.g., terraces, streams, high benches) or cultural features (e.g., Middle Fork Trail) partial closures may be implemented where camp areas contain no cultural materials or where the cultural materials have been determined to be noncontributing to the site’s National Register eligibility through appropriate Section 106 consultation following stipulation 3.b. Where partial camp closures reduce the ability of a specific camp to handle full parties, party size reductions will be implemented as per plan direction.
     2. Use seasonal or inter-site rest rotation to restore site vegetation to protect significant features or sites.
     3. Accept recreation impacts through adverse effect consultation with the Idaho SHPO, affected Tribes, Advisory Council on Historic Preservation and any interested parties.
     4. Where partial closures or rest rotation methods are ineffective or recreation impacts are determined to be unacceptable, close the site to impacting uses by closure order.
     5. Where other methods fail or are unacceptable, complete archaeological data recovery of the impacted campsite following development of a data recovery plan in consultation with Idaho SHPO, affected Tribes, Advisory Council on Historic Preservation and any interested parties.

**Rationale for decision:**

The rationale would link the decision made to wilderness management objectives, law, policy, forest plan standards and guidelines, etc. and explain how this decision best protects the wilderness character while addressing the problem in a feasible manner.

The protective measures selected implement direction provided in the FC-RONR Wilderness Management Plan (including monitoring, education) and also reflect wilderness management principles as described in Forest Service policy. The management strategies approved begin with the least restrictive and intrusive measures and phase in more direct methods of control if demonstrated to be necessary to achieve objectives. Measurable indicators will be used to determine when site conditions justify more intrusive activities, such as subsurface testing. Minimum tool standards and protection of wilderness values will be considered in all action decisions.